UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE NASHVILLE DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
)	
v.)	Case No. 3:22-CR-00327
)	
[1] CHESTER GALLAGHER)	JUDGE TRAUGER
[2] HEATHER IDONI)	
[3] CALVIN ZASTROW)	
[4] COLEMAN BOYD)	
[6] PAUL VAUGHN)	
[7] DENNIS GREEN)	

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO ADD PEREMPTORY CHALLENGES

Defendants, Chester Gallagher, Heather Idoni, Calvin Zastrow, Coleman Boyd, Paul Vaughn, and Dennis Green, by and through undersigned counsel, hereby move the Court to increase the number of peremptory challenges allowed the defendants in light of the number of defendants, their factual differences, and their unique trial strategies.

ANALYSIS

Rule 24(b)(2) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure provides that in a non-capital felony case "the government has 6 peremptory challenges and the defendant or defendants jointly have 10 peremptory challenges." *Id.* The Rule expressly allows the trial court discretion to increase that number and to specify whether the additional challenges are to be exercised jointly or separately, however: "The court may allow additional peremptory challenges to multiple defendants, and may allow the defendants to exercise those challenges separately or jointly." Fed. R. Crim. P. 24(b). Peremptory challenges are important "to help secure the constitutional guarantee of trial by an impartial jury." *United States v. Martinez-Salazar*, 528 U.S. 304, 316 (2000); *accord*, *Frazier v. United States*, 335 U.S. 497, 505 (1948) ("the right [to

1

peremptory challenges] is given in aid of the party's interest to secure a fair and impartial jury"). Accordingly, trial courts have afforded additional peremptory challenges where several defendants are tried jointly. *See*, *e.g.*, *United States v. Frazier*, No. 3:17-cr-00130, 2019 WL 4242412, (M.D. Tenn. Sept. 19, 2019) (Crenshaw, J.) (granting motion for additional peremptory challenges but not determining precise number of additional challenges at that time); *United States v. Haldeman*, 559 F.2d 31, 80 (D.C. Cir. 1976) (granting five additional peremptory strikes to three co-defendants); *United States v. Bailey*, No. CR 19-156 (CKK), 2021 WL 3709712, at *2 (D.D.C. Aug. 20, 2021) (allowing two additional peremptory challenges to be exercised separately to two co-defendants). In the only other felony conspiracy FACE case to be tried, *United States v. Handy*, the court granted five additional peremptory challenges to the five co-defendants.

In the instant case, five co-defendants are being tried jointly. And although the defendants have worked together on a number of issues, there are stark factual differences between some of them and different trial strategies among their counsel. Allowing only ten peremptory challenges, to be exercised jointly, unduly constrains the individual defendants and hampers their ability to adequately assess and exercise their challenges to best serve their individual defenses.

Defendants therefore move the Court to award two additional peremptory challenges to each defendant, to be exercised separately, in addition to the ten challenges to be exercised jointly.

Conclusion

For the foregoing reasons, Defendants respectfully move the Court for an order allowing two additional peremptory challenges for each defendant, to be exercised separately.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Stephen M. Crampton

STEPHEN M. CRAMPTON
Thomas More Society
P.O. Box 4506
Tupelo, MS 38803
(662) 255-9439
scrampton@thomasmoresociety.org

and

LARRY L. CRAIN, Esq. 5214 Maryland Way, Suite 402 Brentwood, TN 37027 (615) 376-2600 larry@crainlaw.legal www.crainlaw.legal Attorneys for Paul Vaughn

/s/ Jodie A. Bell. (by permission)

JODIE A. BELL, Esq. 214 Second Avenue North, Suite 208 Nashville, TN 37201 (615)244-1110/ (615) 956-4977 Attorney for Chester Gallagher

/s/ William Conway (by permission)

WILLIAM J. CONWAY, Esq. 214 Second Avenue North, Suite 208 Nashville, TN 37201 (615) 250-5363 wjconway@gmail.com
Attorney for Heather Idoni

/s/ WRobert Lynn Parris (by permission)

ROBERT LYNN PARRIS, Esq.
Robert L. Parris, Attorney at Law
200 Jefferson Avenue, Suite 1500
Memphis, TN 38103
(901) 490–8026
Fax: (901) 524–1806
rlp@robertparrisattorney.com
Attorney for Defendant Calvin Zastrow

/s/David Komisar (by permission)

DAVID KOMISAR Law Office of David I. Komisar 208 Third Avenue North Suite 300 Nashville, TN 37201 615-242-2675

Fax: 615-256-3330 Email: david@komisarlaw.net

Attorney for Defendant Calvin Zastrow

/s/ G. Kerry Haymaker (by permission)

G. KERRY HAYMAKER, Esq. Haymaker & Heroux, P.C. 545 Mainstream Drive, Suite 420 Nashville, TN 37228 (615) 250-0050 haymaker@tennesseedefense.com Attorney for Defendant Coleman Boyd

<u>/s/ Steve C. Thornton (by permission)</u>

STEVE C. THORNTON, Esq. P.O. Box 16465 Jackson, MS 39236 (601) 982-0313 mail@lawlives.com Attorney for Defendant Coleman Boyd

/s/ Manuel B. Russ (by permission)

MANUEL B. RUSS 340 21st Avenue North Nashville, TN 37203 (615) 329-1919 russben@gmail.com *Attorney for Defendant Dennis Green*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and exact copy of the foregoing Motion to Continue was filed electronically and served on the following by the EF/CME electronic filing system:

JODIE A. BELL 214 Second Avenue North, Suite 208 Nashville, TN 37201 (615)244-1110/ (615) 956-4977 jodie@attorneyjodiebell.com Attorney for Chester Gallagher

WILLIAM J. CONWAY
William J. Conway, Esq. P.C.
214 Second Avenue North, Suite 208
Nashville, TN 37201
(615) 260-5364
wjconway@gmail.com
Attorney for Defendant Heather Idoni

Robert L. Parris, Attorney at Law 200 Jefferson Avenue, Suite 1500 Memphis, TN 38103 (615) 490-8026 rlp@robertparrisattorney.com

ROBERT LYNN PARRIS

DAVID KOMISAR Law Office of David I. Komisar 208 Third Avenue North Suite 300 Nashville, TN 37201 615-242-2675 Fax: 615-256-3330

Email: david@komisarlaw.net Attorneys for Defendant Calvin Zastrow

G. KERRY HAYMAKER
Haymaker & Heroux, P.C.
545 Mainstream Drive. Suite 420
Nashville, TN 37228
(615) 250-0050
haymaker@tennesseedefense.com
Attorney for Defendant Coleman Boyd

MANUEL B. RUSS 340 21st Avenue North Nashville, TN 37203 (615) 329-1919 russben@gmail.com Attorney for Defendant Dennis Green

AMANDA J. KLOPF U.S. Attorney's Office (Nashville) 719 Church Street, Suite 3300 Nashville, TN 37203 (615) 736-5151 amanda.klopf@usdoj.gov Representing USA

KYLE BOYNTON
WILFRED BEAYE
Department of Justice
150 M Street NE
Washington, DC 20002
(202) 598-1018
Sanjay.patel@usdoj.gov
Representing USA

STEVE C. THORNTON, Esq. P.O. Box 16465 Jackson, MS 39236 (601) 982-0313 mail@lawlives.com Attorney for Defendant Coleman Boyd

This the 10th day of January, 2023.

/s/ Stephen M. Crampton_ STEPHEN M. CRAMPTON